## **CULTURAL HERITAGE ASSESSMENT REPORT**

The Book Cemetery, 281 Book Road East, Lot 45, Concession 4, Former Town of Ancaster

**City of Hamilton** 

Prepared by Joseph Muller Cultural Heritage Planner Aided by Mackenzie Keast, Carolyn Van Sligtenhorst and Tyler Bradt Assistant Cultural Heritage Planners Community Planning and Design Section (Heritage and Urban Design) Planning Division Planning and Economic Development Department

for the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

May, 2010

#### CULTURAL HERITAGE ASSESSMENT REPORT: A READER'S GUIDE

This cultural heritage assessment report is prepared as part of a standard process that assists in determining the cultural heritage value of properties and their prospective merit for designation under the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>.

This report includes eight sections:

Section 1 comprises an introduction.

Section 2, *Property Location*, briefly describes the physical location, legal description, and dimensions of the property.

Section 3, *Physiographic Context*, contains a description of the physiographic region in which the subject property is located.

Section 4, *Settlement Context*, contains a description of the broad historical development of the settlement in which the subject property is located as well as the development of the subject property itself. A range of secondary sources such as local histories and a variety of historical and topographical maps are used to describe settlement history and the subject property's key heritage characteristics.

Section 5, *Property Description*, describes the subject property's key heritage characteristics that provide the base information to be used in Section 6.

Section 6, *Cultural Heritage Evaluation*, comprises a detailed evaluation of the subject property using the three sets of evaluation criteria: archaeology; built heritage; and, cultural heritage landscapes.

Section 7, *Cultural Heritage Value: Conclusions and Recommendations*, comprises a brief summary of the Cultural Heritage Evaluation and provides a list of those criteria that have been satisfied in determining cultural heritage value. It also contains a recommendation as to whether or not the subject property should be designated under the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>.

Section 8, *Bibliography*, comprises a list of sources used in the compilation of this report.

# CULTURAL HERITAGE ASSESSMENT REPORT

## The Book Cemetery, 281 Book Road East, Lot 45, Concession 4, Former Town of Ancaster

## **City of Hamilton**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

			Page
1.0	Introd	uction	4
2.0	Property Location		4
3.0	Physiographic Context		4
4.0	4.1 4.2	ment Context Native Settlement Euro-Canadian Settlement Contemporary Context	5 5 6 10
5.0	Prope	erty Description	11
6.0	6.1	ral Heritage Evaluation Archaeology Built Heritage Cultural Heritage Landscapes	12 12 15 17
7.0	Cultur 7.1 7.2 7.3	ral Heritage Value: Conclusions and Recommendations Conclusions Compliance with Ontario Heritage Act Regulation Recommendation	20 20 22 24
8.0	Bibliography		25
Apper	ndix C	-1	

Appendix C-2

Appendix C-3

## 1.0 INTRODUCTION

This cultural heritage assessment examines the heritage attributes of the Book Cemetery (also known as the Book-Parkin Cemetery) located at 281 Book Road East in the former Town of Ancaster. The property includes 85 markers and monuments on a half-acre lot. This cemetery is recorded in the *"Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds."* 

The property has been evaluated according to a set of criteria that was approved by Council on October 22, 2008, and is used to identify the cultural heritage values of a property and to assess their significance. This evaluation assists in determining a property's merit for designation under the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>, R.S.O. 1990, c. 0.18. The property has also been evaluated in compliance with the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>, *Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.* 

## 2.0 PROPERTY LOCATION

The subject property is located at 281 Book Road East, Lot 45, Concession 4, in the former Town of Ancaster, on the north side of Book Road, directly east of this portion of Highway 6 South that opened in 2004 (refer to Location Map attached as Appendix C-1, Figure 1). The cemetery is contained within a flat, irregularly shaped parcel of land surrounded by mature trees. It is bound by a fence and contains 85 monuments of varying condition spanning the years 1815 to 1912. The property forms an irregular rectangular polygon, measuring 42.9 metres (141 feet) on the north side; 59.3 metres (195 feet) on the east; 40.1 metres (132 feet) on the south; and, 51.3 metres (168 feet) on the west side, with an area of 0.2 hectares (0.5 acres). Access to the cemetery is via a steep gravel driveway from the north side of Book Road, east of the Highway 6 South intersection, that winds around the east side of the property to a gate at the north side of the cemetery.

## 3.0 PHYSIOGRAPHIC CONTEXT

The Book Cemetery is located on the prominent elevation (240 metres above sea level) of the Fort Erie Moraine, a ridge of predominantly clay glacial till within the proglacial Haldimand Clay Plain.

The lakebed of glacial Lake Warren formed the Haldimand Clay Plain, lying between the Niagara Escarpment and Lake Erie, and covering approximately 3,496.5 square kilometres (1,350 square miles). The sedimentary bedrock underlying the Haldimand Clay Plain comprises a succession of Palaeozoic beds extending southward, under Lake Erie. Stratified clay comes to the surface on the low ridges found in the northern part of this plain, including the Fort Erie

Moraine. In these areas, a mixture of stratified clay and glacial till may occur.<sup>1</sup> The heavy clay soils of this physiographic zone can be problematic, especially for agricultural practices, as they lack lime, phosphorus and organic material: many areas also have poor drainage. Nevertheless, this area remains primarily a farming community, subject to increasing suburbanization.<sup>2</sup>

The Fort Erie Moraine runs east from Ancaster, encompassing the Book Cemetery and extends eastward to incorporate Mount Hope and Binbrook, ending just before the village of Caistor Centre. Situated between Twenty Mile Creek to the north and the Welland River to the south, the ridge is the headland between these two watersheds.<sup>3</sup> The site is approximately 15 to 18 metres (50 to 60 feet) above Book Road East which lies to the south on the Haldimand Clay Plain.<sup>4</sup>

## 4.0 SETTLEMENT CONTEXT

#### 4.1 Native Settlement

With its favourable physiographic setting and ameliorating climate, the Haldimand Plain, and particularly the Fort Erie Moraine, has attracted human settlement for approximately 12,000 years. Prehistoric Native settlement of this area occurs early with the Paleo-Indian and Early Culture (13,000-10,800 BP). Early, Middle and Late Archaic (10,800-3,100 BP) population sizes increased, more substantially in the following Woodland period (3,100 BP -1,050 AD), typified by large Native villages interspersed with seasonal cabin and hunting sites.<sup>5</sup> New eighteenth century Euro-Canadian settlers often found remnants of Native settlements on their recently patented lands.<sup>6</sup>

However, the intensity of the prehistoric occupation is not fully represented by the density of archaeology in the immediate locale. The subject property's archaeological potential is indicated by its proximity to: three registered archaeological sites; a watercourse; a historic transportation corridor; an early Euro-Canadian settlement area; individual farmsteads; and, the Fort Erie

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Chapman, L.J., and D.F. Putnam, *The Physiography of Southern Ontario*, Third edition (Toronto: Government of Ontario, 1984), 156.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Chapman, L.J., and D.F. Putnam (1984) 159.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Chapman, L.J., and D.F. Putnam (1984) 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> City of Hamilton, Elevation GIS Layer, *City of Hamilton Archaeology Management Plan* (preliminary draft)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Conserving a Future for Our Past: Archaeology, Land Use Planning and Development in Ontario. An Educational Primer and Comprehensive Guide for Non-Specialists. Ontario Archaeological Society/Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation: 1998.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> John B. Morton, "The Indian Era," in *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume I* (Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998), 6.

Moraine.<sup>7</sup> The subject property also has archaeological potential because it is known to contain human remains and has been subject to minimal disturbance.

#### 4.2 Euro-Canadian Settlement

Upon the purchase of the Niagara Peninsula by the British Crown from the Mississauga Nation in 1784, United Empire Loyalists and other immigrant groups began to settle in the area.<sup>8</sup>

There is evidence of Euro-Canadian settlement in the Ancaster area as early as 1789 when land clearance was undertaken by several families squatting on the land. The first survey of Ancaster commenced in 1793, with the lots laid out in the "single front system." The survey included 200 acre lots, 440 yards in width by one and a quarter miles in depth. Concession roads bounded the lots to the north and south while side roads were developed at every fifth lot east of Fiddlers Green Road.

The earliest record of settlers in Ancaster is of the 22 men, often known as "James Wilson and Associates", who squatted on the land from 1789 onwards. A petition, dated 1793 stated that these men "were encouraged by the Land Board and the Acting Surveyor to settle upon those lands four years before they were surveyed which proves now to be reserved lands, your petitioners pray that the same may be confirmed to them."<sup>9</sup> When land was granted, some squatters were informed that they were living on properties reserved for the Crown and thus received orders to move. These settlers submitted petitions to the Land Board, which subsequently moved the reserved lands elsewhere.<sup>10</sup> The 22 men and their families, including John Book, were able to remain on the land they had claimed prior to the survey.<sup>11</sup>

#### Lot 45, Concession 4 and the Book Family

The Crown Patent for Lot 45, Concession 4 was granted to John Book (1754-1827) in 1801.<sup>12</sup> German born John Book married Charity<sup>13</sup> (1752-1829) in 1774.

<sup>10</sup> T. Roy Woodhouse, (1998), 13.

<sup>11</sup> T. Roy Woodhouse, (1998), 17.

<sup>12</sup> He was also granted Lot 44, Concession 4; Lot 44, Concession 5; and the north half of Lot 45, Concession 5, totalling 700 acres.

<sup>13</sup> Charity is likely the middle name of Anna Gertraute, adopted after her marriage to John Book (Johannes Buch) and their move to Upper Canada, as documented in the Baptismal Records of the First German Church in Knowlton, New Jersey. O. Laakso, *John Book (1754-1827 Family Tree* (Media, Pennsylvania Private Printing 2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> City of Hamilton, Potential Modelling GIS Layer, City of Hamilton Archaeology Management Plan (preliminary draft).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> D. B. Smith, The Dispossesion of the Misissauga Indians, *Historical Essays on Upper Canada: New Perspectives* (Ottawa, ON: Carlton UP, 1989), 23-52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> T. Roy Woodhouse, The First Actual Settlers, *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume I* (Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998), 12.

In 1786, the couple and their seven children moved to Knowlton, New Jersey, then relocated to Canada in 1788, staying in St. Catharines, Ontario, before finally settling in Ancaster in 1789. By 1793, Joseph Book was confirmed as one of the initial 22 settlers in Ancaster Township.<sup>14</sup> They eventually had 12 children.<sup>15</sup>

The northern portion of Lot 45, Concession 4, facing Garner Road East, was owned and occupied by various descendants of the Book family. After John Book's death in 1827, his son George John Book inherited all of the 700 acres that had been granted to the family by 1801. George Book granted the north half of Lot 45, Concession 5 to his brother Adam in 1832. From this point onwards, the north half was also known as the south half of Lot 45, Concession 4 (see Appendix C-1, Figure 2).<sup>16</sup> All shares of the lot, however, were eventually purchased by George John's youngest son, William Book (1826-1905), in the 1870s. This property remained in the Book family until *circa* 1998.<sup>17</sup>

The small plot known as the Book Cemetery is located in the southeast corner of the south half of Lot 45, Concession 4, immediately east of the original farm house location (see Appendix C-1, Figure 2). The first family burial in the cemetery was in 1815, for Henry Book, one of John Book's younger sons. The last burial occurred in 1912 for John Book<sup>18</sup>.

Several members of the Book family had large families of their own, connecting them with other local pioneer families such as the Shaver, File, and Vansickle families.<sup>19</sup> The cemetery, along with the house and farmland, remained in the ownership of the Book family until 1907, at which time it was sold to Robert and William J. Parkin – relatives of the Book family through marriage. In 1952, brothers Robert Parkin Jr. and George J. Parkin became the owners of the property.<sup>20</sup> The house on this property was still occupied by Lorne Parkin until 1998, his family being the seventh generation of descendants of John Book to live on the property, marking the end of 209 years of continuous ownership of the

<sup>19</sup> See "The Book Cemetery", a list of burials in the Book Cemetery compiled by Jane Mulkewich, 2007, in Appendix C2.

<sup>20</sup> Carolyn Hawley, *The Book House* (Ancaster, ON: Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee, 1980), 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Paul Grimwood, ed., Ancaster's Heritage: Volume II (Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998), 87.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> John and Charity Book's 12 children were: Anna Elisabeth (1775-1827); twins Anna Mary and Mary Catharine (1776-1845); George John (1779-1857); Lydia (Anna Magdelena) (1781-1846); Margaret (1783-1850); Philippina "Pean" (b.1785); Adam (1786-1869); Christina (1789-1853); Henry (1794?-1815); John (1795-1867); and, Charity (1798-1835). T. Roy Woodhouse, (1998), 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> A. McCulloch, "LOT 45, CONC.4," *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume I* (Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998), 290.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Paul Grimwood, ed., (1998), 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See "The Book Cemetery", a list of burials in the Book Cemetery compiled by Jane Mulkewich, 2007, in Appendix C2.

lot by members of the Book-Parkin family.<sup>21</sup> Many Book descendants still reside in the Ancaster and greater Hamilton areas.

#### Euro-Canadian Funerary Practices

The history of known Judeo-Christian burial practices, sites and cemeteries in the Hamilton area dates from the arrival of permanent Euro-Canadian settlers at the end of the eighteenth century. During the following two-hundred years, the changing views and ways of burying the dead that were to take place across Ontario have also occurred within what is now the City of Hamilton, and the Book Cemetery in particular.

During the last decade of the 18<sup>th</sup> century and first decade of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, as more Euro-Canadian settlers moved into the Hamilton area, burial plots were small and privately owned, typically situated on or near family farms and reserved for family members as exemplified by the Book Cemetery, although neighbours occasionally joined together to form a common burial ground.<sup>22</sup> This may have occurred to a minor extent with the Book cemetery as there are a number of markers inscribed with the names of people that have no obvious family relationship to the Book lineage, such as Dunbar, Gordon, Marlet, and McGuire. These unrelated surnames might have belonged to people who passed away at the Book residence during the time it served as an informal hospital.<sup>23</sup>

Commemoration of the dead, respect for the memory of the deceased and love of family were strong values in the lives of early Euro-Canadian settlers. The installation of a marker paying homage to the recently deceased was a key component of their ritual passage from life on earth, and a reminder to those left behind, until ultimately reunited in the hereafter. Though not always visible, graves were generally accompanied by a wood marker or stone tablet, with the name of the deceased and birth and death dates engraved.<sup>24</sup>

Prior to 1830, stone markers were incised with little more than the name of the deceased, date of death and age at death: for family patriarchs, their place of origin – village, town, parish or country – might be included in the hope that their origins would be remembered by future generations. The utilitarian focus of these early markers in part represents the priorities in the lives of early Euro-Canadian settlers, as is the case with the earliest original markers at the Book Cemetery.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Paul Grimwood, ed., (1998), 89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> "Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds," (City of Hamilton, 2005) 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Historical research has shown that the house (209 Book Rd. E.) occasionally served as a local hospital. The exact dates that it served as a hospital are unknown. The 2 ½ storey Georgian Style brick home was built between 1812 and 1818 by Adam Book. The Ancaster assessment for the property in 1818 was the first to show a substantial building with three fireplaces. Paul Grimwood, "Appendix A," in *The Book House: Historic Structures Report*, ed. Craig Sims. Kingston, ON: Craig Sims Heritage Building Consultant, 2002; Paul Grimwood, ed., (1998), 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> "Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds," (City of Hamilton, 2005), 12.

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED10144 (Page 9 of 25)

As the first Euro-Canadian settlers became established, these monuments increased in complexity, both for later graves and as earlier markers were replaced with more permanent and elaborate versions. This second-generation of early gravestones may be considered works of art, as after 1830 decorative symbols began to appear in increasing numbers, usually carved in the upper portion of the stone. As stone masons arrived in increasing numbers over time and were available for monument work, decoration known as "funerary art" became increasingly popular, and decorative markers became more common than plain ones.

Many of the motifs included on the markers, particularly the religious ones, were hundreds of years old in origin, often derived from England or America. They were usually vernacular interpretations, as no pattern books appear to have been available, so a wide variety of styles may appear in the same cemetery. The iconography of motifs is detailed, while the popularity of specific images changing over time.<sup>25</sup> While the Book Cemetery is early for the Head-of-the-Lake area, the willow (representing mourning or grief) and urn (immortality) motifs that predominate are relatively late in this pattern of historic iconography. Other examples of motifs include clasped hands (marking farewells), a hand pointing upwards (to the departed's destination in heaven), a dove or harp (for resurrection), wheat sheaves (the divine harvest), and the wreath (celebrating the victory of life over death).<sup>26</sup> It also became common to include an epitaph on the marker or monument in memory of the deceased,<sup>27</sup> as is the case with the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century markers at Book Cemetery.

Monuments from the initial and second phases of marker styles are typified by stone slabs, usually of soft marble, ranging from three to four feet in height, two to three feet in width, and one or two inches thick. The majority of Book Cemetery markers fit this description, as they were affordable and readily transportable, while of sufficiently high value to mark the significance of the grave. They had sufficient capacity for customizing the inscriptions, and later artwork, on their faces to represent the individual interred.

Significant changes from these initial marker patterns appear in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century, marking a new style of commemorative cemetery markers. Large marble monuments started being used to mark significant individuals or families, such as Gussie Book (Appendix C-2 #71, Appendix C-3 #5) and Harriet Book (Appendix C-2 #70, Appendix C-3 #11). In addition, granite is introduced as a new monument material. Prior to 1850, the cost was prohibitive, but by *circa* 1880 blocky granite monuments were being used for high-status individuals

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Deetz, James, and Edwin S. Dethlefsen. "Death's Head, Cherub, Urn and Willow" in *Natural History* Vol. 76(3) 1967, pp. 29-37

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Headstone#Form\_and\_decoration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> "Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds," (City of Hamilton, 2005), 11.

(William Kelly, #67 in Appendix C-2, #33 in Appendix C-3) or significant families.<sup>28</sup>

## 4.3 Contemporary Context

In 2004, Lot 45, containing the Book House and Cemetery, was divided by the construction of Highway 6 South (see Appendix C-1, Figures 3a and 3b), linking Highway 403 in Ancaster to the extant Highway 6 South (formerly the 1844 Port Dover Plank Road), at Mount Hope. As a result, the landscape surrounding the Book Cemetery is substantially altered. A cut for the new highway was excavated through the moraine ridge, forming a valley between the cemetery and the former Book property to the west. The original Book farmhouse (constructed 1812–1818) to the west of the cemetery was destroyed by fire in 2005.

The cemetery was originally accessed through the Book farmstead, now terminated by the construction of the Highway 6 South: direct access to the cemetery was then provided by the City of Hamilton from Book Road East (see Appendix C-1, Figure 3b). This direct access has allowed for continuing repair and maintenance, with a new wire fence installed around the perimeter of the cemetery. Trees, stumps, and brush were subsequently removed from around the graves to protect markers and graves. Coniferous trees and deciduous shrubs were planted at the entrance to the cemetery.

There are a variety of gravestones in the cemetery, but the majority are upright rectangular stone slabs, often sparingly decorated. Five obelisk or columnar style monuments and three large, block-like granite markers are also present: these are largely modern replacements or rededications. Many of the older upright markers have experienced substantial weathering and are broken (see Appendix C-1, Figures 4 and 5). More recent gravestones are in good condition. After amalgamation in 2001, the City of Hamilton became responsible for the site.<sup>29</sup>

## 5.0 PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

The cemetery is not visible from either Book Road East or Highway 6 South due to its location within a stand of trees on the ridge overlooking these roads to the south and west respectively (see Appendix C-1, Figure 6). Access to the site is via a gated gravel driveway on the north side of Book Road East, east of the intersection with Highway 6 South. The driveway circumnavigates east of the cemetery as it climbs up the moraine slope, leading to the cemetery gate along its northern boundary fence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>"Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds," (City of Hamilton, 2005), 14-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> "Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds," (City of Hamilton, 2005), 23.

The cemetery is well-maintained and bounded by a post and wire fence. The majority of trees in and around the property are black walnut, with a grove of birch trees immediately to the west of the site.

Eighty-five (85) grave markers and monuments are visible within the fenced area, concentrated in the south-east quadrant of the cemetery (see Appendix C-3).<sup>30</sup> The stones are set out in eight (8) rows running from north to south, with the burials oriented east-west. Seventy-seven (77) of the markers are marble: the remaining 8 are granite and more recently placed as rededications or replacements. Many of the marble markers are broken, with only fragments remaining, while others have tipped, been laid flat, or have sunken into the ground. Many inscriptions have become illegible, especially on the older markers (see Appendix C-3).

The inscriptions that are legible, visually or through rubbing, reveal information on the genealogy of the Book family (refer to Appendix C-2 for a list of individuals buried in the cemetery). Nine of John and Charity Book's children were buried in the cemetery.<sup>31</sup> There are also over twenty (20) surnames of other nearby settlers, including File, Morton, and Weldon, visible on the markers and monuments, revealing the common connections to other families made through marriage. Many of these last names belong to daughters and granddaughters of John and Charity Book who married into local families.

Archival research and site data analysis reveals that approximately 23% of those buried were infant deaths, with the remaining as adults between the ages of 65 and 85 years (see Appendix C-1, Figure 8). The most active phase of cemetery use occurred between 1865 and 1885 when a total of 36 (42%) of all recorded burials took place in this 20 year span (see Appendix C-1, Figure 9).<sup>32</sup>

## 6.0 CULTURAL HERITAGE EVALUATION

Since its amendment in 2002, the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> enables municipalities to designate property of cultural heritage value or merit, including real property, buildings and structures.

On June 19, 2003, the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee endorsed a set of evaluation criteria for use in assessing cultural heritage resources, and City Council adopted these on October 22, 2008. The application of these criteria assists in determining the cultural heritage value of a property and its prospective merit for designation under the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>. The subject property has

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> 88 burials are recorded at the site: the number of markers may be lower for two main reasons. Not all individual burials receive separate commemorative stones, and stones are occasionally removed for various reasons ranging from formal process to mischief. Additional unmarked burials may also result from uninvited use of the cemetery.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> T. Roy Woodhouse, (1998), 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> See "The Book Cemetery", a list of burials in the Book Cemetery compiled by Jane Mulkewich, 2007

been evaluated against these criteria (Archaeology, Built Heritage, and Cultural Heritage Landscapes) as follows:

## 6.1 Archaeology

Identified or potential archaeological resources can be considered as values meriting inclusion into the description of heritage attributes of a property. A set of twelve (12) criteria is used to evaluate an archaeological site or measure archaeological value to determine what attributes, if any, warrant designation under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>:

Cultural Definition: Applicable	Site Setting: Applicable	
Temporal Integrity: Applicable	Site Socio-political Value: Applicable	
Site Size: Applicable	Site Uniqueness: Applicable	
Site Type: Applicable	Site Rarity: Applicable	
Site Integrity: Applicable	Site Human Remains: Applicable	
Historical Association: Applicable	Archaeological Potential: Applicable	

All 12 criteria were applicable or applied, and of these, 11 were satisfied, confirming archaeological value as follows.

### **Cultural Definition**

The cemetery does not solely define a cultural complex or horizon on a local or regional scale. It does however act as a prime example of early pioneer burial practices. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

## Temporal Integrity

This site was used continuously by the Book family as a cemetery from 1815 to 1912. The cemetery has not been subject to major soil disruptions other than burials. This continuity of use and ownership has resulted in an intact archaeological site. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

## Site Size

With 85 visible markers and monuments, this site has more markers and monuments than most pioneer family cemeteries in the City of Hamilton. For example, Dyment Cemetery in Ancaster has only 17 markers, and the Betzner Family Burial Ground in West Flamborough has only four. Further, it is substantially larger than the Shaver Family Cemetery, previously designated under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>: only the Hatt-Cooley Cemetery, also in Ancaster, may be larger. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

## Site Type

This site is of a distinctive and well-defined type as it functioned continuously and solely as a family cemetery. No activities other than those related to its primary function have impacted the subject property. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

#### Site Integrity

Although some of the markers have been damaged and displaced, the cemetery itself has remained intact. While the landscape immediately west of the cemetery has been substantially altered by the excavation of the Highway 6 South road cut, the remainder of the rural context remains. The land within the cemetery has not experienced any major soil disruptions aside from the burials. The soil horizons and burials do not show signs of significant disturbance other than natural processes. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

#### Historical Association

The cemetery is directly associated with the Book family of Ancaster. It is located on Lot 45, Concession 4, land that was granted to John Book in 1801. Book and his family had been squatting on the property since 1789. The cemetery was first used by the Book family in 1815 and represents a long-term association with this established family as it was used continuously and predominantly by the Books and their extended family until 1912. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

#### Setting

The construction of this portion of Highway 6 South has substantially impacted the landscape to the west of the cemetery. However, the remaining lands that surround the cemetery are historically and physically important to the Book Cemetery. The rest of Lot 45, Concession 4, remains farmland that was owned and operated by the Book family and its descendants for over two centuries. Of the two original Book farmhouses, only one remains, located immediately to the west of the cemetery across the highway. The surrounding farm fields provide relevant context to the cultural heritage value of the cemetery, and both the cemetery and the site of the farmhouse remain elevated above the surrounding plain. Accordingly, this criterion has been only partially satisfied.

#### Socio-political value

The local community places a high value on the Book Cemetery, resulting in its conservation during the design and construction of Highway 6 South between 1993 and 2004. The continuing community interest is expressed by the request to designate the site in order to maintain its heritage value. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

#### Uniqueness

The subject property is not unique as it is one of several pioneer family cemeteries in the City. Accordingly, this criterion has not been satisfied.

#### Rarity

The majority of the City of Hamilton's older cemeteries began as family burial grounds prior to being assumed by the municipality or a religious institution. It is notable that few remained family plots under the ownership of the same family until their eventual closure, as is the case with the Book Cemetery. When comparing this cemetery to other family plots in the City of Hamilton, it appears

that there are only four other cemeteries that are comparable in age and use. Of these, the Book Cemetery is the second oldest. This cemetery has good integrity, in comparison to the large number of family cemeteries in Hamilton that have been lost or abandoned. Due to the rarity of pioneer cemeteries continuously managed by descendants (and the infrequency of these plots still existing), in conjunction with the significant age of the site, the Book Cemetery can be considered a rare archaeological site. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

#### Human Remains

This cemetery has been documented and reported twice, once in the 1890s by a local resident, Crowell Smith, and again in 1985 by the Hamilton Branch of the Ontario Genealogical Society. These records, along with other documents, reveal that there were likely 88 burials in the cemetery, between 1815 and 1912. This cemetery definitely contains human remains of which 3 or more may currently be unmarked. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

### Archaeological Potential

The subject property meets 7 of the Ministry of Culture's 11 criteria for having archaeological potential.

- Within 250 metres of a known archaeological site;
- Within 300 metres of water/prehistoric water;
- An area of elevated topography;
- Associated with unusual landforms;
- An area of Euro-Canadian pioneer settlement;
- Within 100 metres of a historic transportation corridor; and,
- Documentary evidence, local knowledge or oral history associates the property with historic activities, events or occupation (confirmed pioneer cemetery).

These criteria define the property as having archaeological values.

## 6.2 Built Heritage

A set of 12 criteria is used to identify and assess the built heritage values of a property to determine what attributes, if any, warrant designation under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>. For the purposes of "Built Heritage" evaluation, only the grave markers, monuments and headstone have been evaluated. These are considered to be discrete and separate from the entire cemetery complex and cultural heritage landscape which is evaluated in its entirety under "Cultural Heritage Landscapes" in Section 6.3.

Historical Associations				
Thematic	Applicable			
Event	N/A			
Person and/or group	Applicable			
Architecture and Design				
Architectural merit	Applicable			
Functional merit	Applicable			
Designer	N/A			
Integrity				
Location integrity	Applicable			
Built integrity	Applicable			
Environmental Context				
Landmark	N/A			
Character	N/A			
Setting	Applicable			
Social Value				
Public perception	Applicable			

Eight of the 12 criteria were applicable or applied, and all of these were satisfied, confirming the built heritage value as follows.

### **Historical Associations**

#### Thematic

The grave markers are of vernacular design using local materials, and representative of Ontario's historical Euro-Canadian cemetery and funerary practices of the nineteenth century. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Event

Not applicable

#### Person and/or Group

As a family burial site, the majority of grave markers are directly related to and associated with the Book family, who were a prominent pioneer family in Ancaster Township, with many descendants still living in the area. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Architecture and Design

#### Architectural Merit

Seventy-seven of the markers are rectangular in shape, comprising marble with simple engravings, while eight of the later gravestones are more elaborate neoclassical or Greek revival styles in granite. These designs are illustrative of modest marker design common among pioneer family cemeteries. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Functional Merit

Grave markers may be viewed as strictly utilitarian, and examples without the artwork found on most of the Book Cemetery markers are found elsewhere in Ontario. Their function takes precedent over style, as they primarily serve as a permanent commemoration of an individual's life. The majority of Book family markers are marble, commonly used for markers in Southern Ontario. Granite appears near the end of the cemetery's life, chosen for its resistance to weathering and as a status material. Granite was sourced further afield and represents both changes in trade patterns and material goods in the late historic period, and the status ascribed by its use. Both marble and granite were selected as durable materials that would withstand weathering over time.

Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

Designer Not applied.

#### Integrity

#### Locational Integrity

The burial sites have not been moved since the last burial in 1912. While some markers have become damaged or fallen, they have remained in their original location within the cemetery. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### **Built Integrity**

The extant markers remain largely unaltered from the time of their installation. While there is no record of any markers being modified or refurbished in any way, and the degree of weathering on the early gravestones is testament to this, only eight (less than 10%) have been replaced or rededicated. Long term exposure to the elements has resulted in some substantial weathering, and in combination with frost-wedging and cracking, some markers have broken due to excessive weathering. These fragmentary components have subsequently been stacked on or near their source monument. Overall, however, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Environment Context

*Landmark* Not applied.

#### Character Not applied.

#### Setting

The cemetery is located on a prominent ridge and surrounded by mature trees that conceals its presence from nearby Book Road and Highway 6 South. The construction of this portion of Highway 6 South has greatly altered the landscape to the west of the cemetery. However, the remaining lands that surround the cemetery provide intact historical and physical context important to the Book

Cemetery. The remainder of Lot 45, Concession 4 is the original farmland that was owned and operated by the Book family for 209 years. There are some significant archaeological remains at the site of the Book family home, located immediately to the west of the cemetery across the highway cut. The site of the original farmhouse and the surrounding farm fields provide relevant context to the cemetery. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

#### Social Value

#### Public Perception

Cemeteries and their gravestones are inherently valuable to the public as memorials and historical resources. When plans for Highway 6 South included potential relocation or removal of the Book Family Cemetery, members of the community and Book family lobbied successfully to alter the proposed location of the future highway and thereby retain the integrity of the cemetery and markers. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

## 6.3 Cultural Heritage Landscape

The application of criteria for designation of a property as a Cultural Heritage Landscape depends upon the property's characteristics. Types of cultural heritage landscapes that have been identified for prospective inventory and evaluation work are as follows:

Farm complex	Waterscape	
Hamlet	Railway	
Commercial core/streetscape	Abandoned road R.o.W.	
Industrial complex	Public park	
Cemetery/church/rectory or other religious complex	Private garden/estate	
Roadscape	Agricultural fairground	
Residential area		

Cultural Heritage Landscapes can be considered as values meriting inclusion into the description of heritage attributes of a property. A set of nine (9) criteria is used to determine which cultural heritage landscape values and attributes warrant designation under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> as a Cultural Heritage Landscape:

Themes: Applicable	Material Content: Applicable	
Event: N/A	Integrity: Applicable	
Person and/or Group: Applicable	Design: Applicable	
Sense of Place: Applicable	Public Perception: Applicable	
Serial Vision: N/A		

Seven of the nine criteria were applicable or applied, and all of these were satisfied, confirming the Cultural Heritage Landscape value as follows.

#### **Historical Associations**

#### Themes

This cemetery is representative of pioneer family plots developed in nineteenthcentury rural Ontario and is therefore illustrative of this cultural development on a local, provincial, and national level. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Event

Not applied.

#### Person and/or Group

As a family plot, this site is directly associated with the Book family who owned and lived on the property for more two centuries. The cemetery was begun by the Book family, a prominent pioneer family of Ancaster Township, and was used continuously by them until the early twentieth-century. Many of John and Charity Book's descendants still live in Ancaster. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Scenic Amenity

#### Sense of Place

The subject property provides viewers with a strong sense of place when observing the site from within. It is easily recognizable as a cemetery with the markers and monuments in a traditional Judeo-Christian layout, while the surrounding stand of trees provides a sense of enclosure. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Serial Vision

Not applied.

#### Material Content

The nature of the markers and monuments also add to the authenticity of the space. The cemetery is a venue for displaying the vernacular character of crafted headstones depicting social and spatial relationships. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Integrity

Until the first decade of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, access to the cemetery was generally limited to the members of the Book and the Parkin families. The separation of the Book family farmstead from the cemetery by Highway 6 South has only affected the cultural heritage value of the subject property within its wider surroundings. Subsequently, the site has remained relatively undisturbed since the last burial in 1912. Despite the deterioration of markers, historical research and visits to the site demonstrate that the property has retained much of its historic fabric. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Design

There is no known designer associated with this cemetery, nor is there a formally designed landscape plan. However, the cemetery has been formally organized

along a simple grid system of burials in a Christian tradition with the rows oriented north-south, and individual graves along the east-west axis. The Book family intentionally delineated this portion of the property as a burial ground, and were custodians of this cemetery. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

#### Social Value

#### Public Perception

Cemeteries are valuable to the public in a number of ways, as memorials and historical resources. In addition, they become an established part of the landscape. This particular component is valued by descendants of the Book family and local residents. When plans for the new Highway 6 South included potential relocation or removal of the cemetery, members of the community and Book family successfully campaigned to relocate the future highway to ensure that the integrity of the burial ground could be retained. Accordingly, this criterion is satisfied.

# 7.0 CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

## 7.1 Conclusions

The subject property satisfies criteria in all three categories with which its cultural heritage values are evaluated: 11 of the 12 criteria for archaeology, 8 of the 11 criteria for built heritage, and 7 of the 9 criteria for cultural heritage landscapes.

#### Archaeology

The subject property satisfies 11 of the 12 criteria pertaining to archaeology:

*Cultural Definition:* The cemetery is a prime example of early pioneer burial practices.

*Temporal Integrity:* This land was used continuously by the Book family as a cemetery and has remained stable without major soil disturbance.

*Site Size:* The site has approximately 85 visible markers and monuments, making it the largest family cemetery in the City of Hamilton.

*Site Type:* The site is easily identifiable as a cemetery and has been used continuously and solely as a family burial ground.

*Site Integrity:* The cemetery shows no signs of significant soil disturbance and therefore retains high integrity.

*Historical Association:* This site was used as a cemetery for 97 years by the Book family, a historically prominent lineage in Ancaster, and owned by the same family for over 200 years.

*Setting:* Despite the disruption to the site context by the Highway 6 South, the farmlands surrounding the cemetery retain historical and physiographic context.

*Socio-political value:* Significant public interest in the conservation of the Book Cemetery in the past and present equates with a high value attributed to the site.

*Rarity:* While there are several family cemeteries in the City of Hamilton, the Book Cemetery is one of only a few that remained under the ownership and exclusive use of the same family until becoming inactive. It is also one of the oldest and largest local examples of its kind in the city.

*Human Remains:* Historical records indicate that there were 88 recorded burials in this cemetery between 1815 and 1912.

Archaeological Potential:

The subject property meets 7 of the Ministry of Culture's 11 criteria for determining archaeological potential.

### Built Heritage

The subject property satisfies 8 of the 11 criteria pertaining to built heritage of historical or architectural value:

*Thematic:* The grave markers are of vernacular style using primarily local materials, representative of contemporary family cemeteries in Ontario.

*Person and/or Group:* As a family cemetery, the grave markers are directly related to the Book family. The Book family is representative of other Euro-Canadian settlers in southern Ontario of the same period.

*Architectural Merit:* The headstone styles are illustrative of modest marker design common among pioneer family cemeteries.

*Functional Merit:* The majority of early Book family markers are marble, commonly used for commemorative stones in Southern Ontario at the time, while a few of the latest markers are granite. Both were selected as durable materials that would withstand weathering over time.

*Locational Integrity:* The burial site has remained essentially unchanged since the last burial in 1912, and the markers have remained in their original location.

Built Integrity: The markers remain unchanged since they were erected.

*Setting:* Despite the disruption of the land to the west by Highway 6 South, the farmlands surrounding the burial site retain historical and physiographic context.

*Public Perception:* Members of the community and Book family, concerned with the impact of Highway 6 South and the future integrity of the site, have requested that this cemetery be preserved and designated.

#### Cultural Heritage Landscape

The subject property satisfies 7 of the 9 criteria pertaining to Cultural Heritage Landscapes:

*Themes:* This site is representative of family cemeteries established in nineteenth-century rural Ontario by pioneer families.

*Person and/or Group:* This cemetery is directly associated with the Book family, a prominent pioneer family that owned and lived on the property for more than two centuries.

*Sense of Place:* The site is recognizable to viewers as a cemetery and provides a strong sense of place as a historic rural family cemetery.

*Material Content:* This cemetery is a visually satisfying landscape located in a pastoral setting with panoramic views.

*Integrity:* The use of this isolated site was solely managed by the Book family and did not experience any major soil disturbance other than burials.

*Design:* This site was not formally planned by a designer but it was clearly designated, organized and used primarily as a cemetery by the Book family.

*Public Perception:* Members of the community and Book family, concerned with the impact of the Highway 6 South and the future integrity of the site, have requested that this cemetery be preserved and designated.

The subject property satisfies 26 of the 32 criteria used by the City of Hamilton to evaluate its cultural heritage value. The weight of this evaluation supports designation of the property.

#### 7.2 Compliance with the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>, *Ontario Regulation 9/06*: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

According to Subsection 1 (2) of *Ontario Regulation 9/06*, *Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest*, a property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets one or more of the following criteria:

- "1. The property has design value or physical value because it,
  - i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
  - ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
  - iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
- 2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,
  - i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to the community,
  - ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
  - iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
- 3. The property has contextual value because it,
  - i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,
  - ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
  - iii. is a landmark."

The subject property meets 6 of the 9 criteria in all three categories defined by *Ontario Regulation 9/06* to evaluate the cultural heritage value or interest of a candidate property for designation under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>.

- 1. Design or physical value:
  - i. The Book family cemetery is a unique and early example of a Euro-Canadian pioneer cemetery; and,
  - ii. The commemorative markers and cemetery location and design display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- 2. Historical value or associative value:
  - i. The Book family cemetery has direct associations with the Book family that is significant to the community; and,
  - ii. Yields, and has the potential to yield further, information that contributes to an understanding of the community.
- 3. Contextual value:
  - i. The Book family cemetery Is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area; and,
  - ii. The Book family cemetery is physically and historically linked to its surroundings.

#### 7.3 Recommendations

The property at 281 Book Road East is recommended for designation. The Book Cemetery on Part Lot 45, Concession 4, in the former Town of Ancaster satisfies the City of Hamilton's evaluation criteria for properties of cultural heritage value, and the Ontario Ministry of Culture's criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest under the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

#### Publications

Chapman, L.J., and D.F. Putnam. *The Physiography of Southern Ontario*. Third edition. Toronto: Government of Ontario, 1984.

City of Hamilton. *Recommendation to designate the building known as the Book House at 209 Book Road East*. Hamilton, ON: City of Hamilton, 2002.

City of Hamilton. *"Hamilton's Heritage Volume 6: Inventory of Cemeteries and Burial Grounds."* Hamilton ON: City of Hamilton, 2005.

Grimwood, Paul. "Appendix A." In *The Book House: Historic Structures Report*, ed. Craig Sims. Kingston, ON: Craig Sims Heritage Building Consultant, 2002.

Grimwood, Paul, ed. *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume II*. Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998.

Hawley, Carolyn. *The Book House*. Ancaster, ON: Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee, 1980.

McCulloch, A. "LOT 44, CONC.4." *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume I.* Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998. 290.

Morton, John B. "The Indian Era." *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume I.* Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998.

Mulkewich, Jane. Interview by Carolyn Van Sligtenhorst. Book Cemetery, Nov. 2, 2007.

Mulkewich, Jane. "Book Cemetery Inventory" Compiled 2007.

Ontario Genealogical Society, Hamilton Branch. "Book Cemetery Transcription" 1989.

Smith, Crowell. "Book Cemetery Transcription" 1890.

"The Book House." In 209 Book Road Book House (1818) File. Hamilton, ON: City of Hamilton.

Woodhouse, T.Roy. "The First Actual Settlers." *Ancaster's Heritage: Volume I.* Ancaster, ON: Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1998.

### Maps

Location Map for 281 Book Road East, Former Township of Ancaster.

Sheffield, H.C. Illustrated Historical Atlas of the County of Wentworth Ontario, 1875.

"Physiography of Southern Ontario," *Ontario Geological Survey Map* P.2715, 1984.

### Other

City of Hamilton. Elevation GIS Layer, *City Of Hamilton Draft Archaeology Management Plan.* 

City of Hamilton. Potential Modelling GIS Layer, *City of Hamilton Draft Archaeology Management Plan.*